

**REPORT**  
**OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSIONS ON THE EVALUATION OF**  
**THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 6R113100, 7R021 - "ORAL AND**  
**MAXILLOFACIAL SURGERY, INCLUDING PEDIATRIC SURGERY"**  
**JSC "KAZAKH MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF CONTINUING EDUCATION"**  
**TO MEET THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR PROGRAMMES OF**  
**POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION (RESIDENCY SPECIALTY) MEDICAL**  
**ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION**

**period of external expert evaluation: December 3-4, 2020**

**1. Composition of the External Expert Commission**

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 20 dated November 13, 2020, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes of residency specialties of JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" (hereinafter - KazMUNO) in the period from 3 to 4 December 2020, consisting of:



**Chairman of the External Expert Commission**

ZHANALINA BAHYT SEKERBEKOVNA,  
Doctor of Medicine, Associate Professor of the  
Department of Surgical and Pediatric Dentistry,  
NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University  
named after Marat Ospanov"



**The foreign expert**

KATROPA LIDIA GEORGIEVA,

Doctor of Medicine, Doctor of Sociology,  
Professor of the Department of Public Health in  
Dentistry at the Medical University of Sofia,  
Member of the ADEE (the Association for Dental  
Education in Europe), awarded the medal of the  
European Association for Dental Education,  
included in the almanac "Luminaries in  
Bulgarian Medicine»



**National Academic Expert**

MULDAEVA GULMIRA MENDIGIREEVNA,  
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of  
the Department of Family Medicine  
NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"



### **Expert Representative of Practical Health**

**KALIBEKOVA GULNARA**

**ZARKYNBEKOVNA,**

PhD, Master of Public Health, General Practitioner, Deputy Chief Physician of the SPE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 10"



### **Expert - representative of residents**

**GOGALADZE KONSOL LATIFOVICH,**

resident in the specialty " Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery " NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"

### **ECAQA Observer**

**UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA**

Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department

NU "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care"

tel .: +77475609212,

e-mail: [infoECAQAqa@gmail.com](mailto:infoECAQAqa@gmail.com)

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 6R113100, 7R021 - " Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery " of KazMUNO for compliance with the Accreditation Standards programmes of postgraduate education (specialty residency) of medical educational institutions of ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC on the further improvement of the educational activities of the university in the field of postgraduate education.

#### **2. General part of the final report of the EEC**

**2.1 Presentation JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" and educational residency programme in the specialty 6R113100, 7R021 - "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery".**

The Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" has a State license №KZ52LAA00006249, issued on December 03, 2015 for educational activities. **JSC "KazMUNO" received annex No. 020 dated 28.03.2020 to the license for the specialty of residency 7R091 "Healthcare (medicine)".**

For more than half a century, KazMUNO has been the coordinating centre in the Republic of Kazakhstan for postgraduate training of highly qualified specialists and continuing professional development of medical personnel for practical health care, medical science and education.

More than 200 teachers have academic degrees, including 65 doctors of sciences, 132 candidates of sciences, 55 employees have an academic master's degree. The teaching staff carries out medical and advisory clinical activities, consultations for the most severe patients throughout the country.

There are more than 50 departments and courses in KazMUNO, which cover the entire cycle of education: bachelor's and internship, residency, master's degree, doctoral studies and additional education. Every year, about 1,500 students are admitted here, over 10,000 specialists undergo advanced training from all regions.

Since 2017, the university has been implementing a joint two-degree Kazakh-Finnish magistracy in the specialty "Nursing" with a two-year training period. Within the framework of academic mobility, undergraduates of KazMUNO are trained in applied sciences JAMK, HAMK and LAHT in Finland.

KazMUNO is the first medical university in Kazakhstan, where an innovative model of medical education and improving the quality of medical services through tele mentoring - the ECHO project - has been introduced. This project is being implemented in more than 15 countries around the world. To implement this Project, a Training Center for clinical mentoring and advanced training of medical personnel through telecommunication technologies was created at KazMUNO.

KazMUNO maintains business relations with 40 universities and research centres from 20 countries of the world.

To ensure the educational process, contracts have been signed with 107 clinical bases in the city and region.

To improve the quality of practical training of medical specialists, a Centre for Practical and Communication Skills was created on the basis of KazMUNO, where the improvement of teaching clinical skills is carried out using simulation training on high-tech modern simulators, dummies and virtual simulators. For foreign, non-resident students, the University has a six-story dormitory with 700 seats, a library with 68 seats, where there are over 60,000 books. Here readers can use not only Kazakhstani, but also international information resources.

For innovative methods of organizing the educational process, 7 automated information systems have been introduced. Their use makes it possible to increase the efficiency of management in various areas of the university's activities, and also contributes to the effective and optimal organization of the educational process. The systems allow testing and webinars via audio-video communication.

## **2.2 Information on previous accreditation**

Accreditation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 6R113100, 7R021- "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery" until now has not been carried out.

## **2.3 Analysis of the report on self-assessment of the residency educational programme in the specialty 6R113100, 7R021 "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery"**

Self-assessment of the educational programme in the specialty of residency 6R113100, 7R021 "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery" JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" was carried out on the basis of the order of the rector of KazMUNO No. 37-RD dated 01.09.2020.

The self-assessment report of the educational programme is presented on 93 pages of main text, appendices on 22 pages and copies or electronic versions of documents on the organization of education.

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by an accompanying a

letter signed by the rector Sadykova Sholpan Sauatbekovna, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of KazMUNO, responsible for the self-assessment of educational programmes, Doskozhaeva S.T., vice-rector for clinical activities, acting Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs and Youth Affairs - member of the Board.

The working group in the amount of 14 people headed by the chairman Doskozhaeva S.T. (as of 09.10.2020) a certain amount of work was done to prepare the self-assessment report: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffing, educational resources were analysed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with Accreditation standard for postgraduate education programmes (specialty residency) of medical educational organizations (hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database, applications on 22 pages, are presented in full, sequentially and there are references to them in the text of the report. The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

All standards contain the real practice of KazMUNO for the training of residents in the specialty 6R113100, 7R021 "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2017 and 2019, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, knowledge and skills assessment results, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, base), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The conclusion for each of the 9 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified during the self-examination and development prospects for this specialty.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited educational residency programme of KazMUNO contains objective, detailed, structured information on all types of activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made the appropriate corrections in the report at the expert evaluation stage....

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work on the assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 6R113100, 7R021 "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational institutions and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the NU "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care" No. 5 of February 17, 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on November 25, 2020 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbaeva S.S. and agreed with the rector Sh.S. Sadykova.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with residents, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and residents, review resources

in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of 43 educational and methodological documents, both before the visit to the university, and during the visit.

The sequence of the visit within 2 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the annex to this report.

**The first day of the visit is 12/03/2020.** An interview with the management and key employees of KazMUNO made it possible to determine the fulfilment of most of the criteria for accreditation standards 1,2,5,7,8,9, namely, to identify approaches in developing the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university, the role and place of postgraduate education in clinical direction in the university's strategy (plan), mechanisms for determining the appropriate specialty of residency of clinical bases and qualified teachers, guarantees of the adequacy of educational resources through planning public procurements and concluding agreements with international partners (more than 106 contracts). Realizing that the accredited residency programme is relatively new, since the recruitment of students under the new SES took place in 2019-2020, the experts studied in detail the documentation, including progress and attendance journals, including electronic journals on the Platonus platform of residents in the discipline "Surgery oral cavity "(paper and AIS), modular curricula, syllabuses, methodological support of practical classes (CBL), control and measuring instruments, examination sheets, individual work plans Ibrayimova B.T., specialty: 7R021 "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery " Duration of training in residency: 02.09.2019-31.08.2022. Department: maxillofacial surgery with a course of plastic surgery Curator: Nurmaganov S.B. A document dated 09/05/2019, which defines the training trajectory by year, a list of mandatory practical / clinical skills, a portfolio, with documents confirming the achievements of the resident.

The experts found that the university strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for academic work, reporting, etc.).

The basis for effective management is the Quality Assurance Policy of KazMUNO and the "Department Policies" developed at the departments of residency, as well as adherence to the Quality Guidelines in the implementation of documenting the educational process (QMS has been constantly supported and certified since 2012).

A conversation with a leading specialist in the department of residency allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching residents, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents for different specialties, informational provision of postgraduate education, as well as identifying problems in the management and development of human resources, since most of the practicing doctors do not know the teaching methodology, the university does not there is a policy to stimulate and motivate clinical mentors from among the representatives of practical health care.

Meeting with HR-manager Tleugalikyzy S.T. and Leading Specialist of the Residency Department Sarsenbayeva L.Kh. made it possible to learn about human resources, monitoring the employment of residents and satisfaction with the quality of training of residents.

Visit and conversation with the head of the Centre for Clinical and Communication Skills Ibrayeva S.A. allowed experts to learn about the methodological support of the emergency care station in case of emergency (CPR in adults and children, delivery, gastric lavage, etc.). Teachers of the departments are involved as standardized patients.

Visit and conversation with the head of the library Zhusipbekova S.S. allowed experts to assess the security of the residency programme in the specialty 6R113100, 7R021 - "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery" educational, methodical and scientific literature, including electronic forms, access to international databases (Elsevier, THOMSON REUTERS (WEB OF SCIENCE)), the demand for the library fund among residents, library attendance by residents. 24-hour access to information resources is provided.

The experts obtained evidence of compliance with accreditation standards 2 and 6, as well as the reliability of the information in the self-assessment report of the educational programme.

On the same day, interviews were held with teachers, residents and employers (representatives of practical healthcare), together with a foreign expert, Professor Lidia Katrova (Bulgaria).

One graduation took place under the accredited educational residency programme in the specialty 6R113100 - "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery" and the percentage of employment was 100%.

In order to reliably fulfil the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the educational programme, interviews were conducted with residents. 28 residents attended. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with university studies, sufficient time for practical training, patient supervision and work with medical records, as well as satisfaction with teaching methods and teacher qualifications. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this university, since they believe that KazMUNO has excellent clinical bases and experience in teaching residents, at the same time, residents would like to work more independently with patients. Residents believe that they can continue their education after graduation from the university.

Residents showed their commitment to the chosen specialty and organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their opinions on organizing training, assessing their skills, consulting support, opportunities to participate in research and development, funding, etc. The experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio of residents, IDP, results of assessment of residents-checklists, results of a questionnaire survey of residents).

Interviews with teachers, as providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, depending on the specific clinical base (access of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work of residents) ... The experts received answers on the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of the teachers' certification in teaching methods and on motivation.

An interview with 3 employers on the KazMUNO educational programme of residency declared for accreditation was conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the deliberative bodies of KazMUNO, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and the university as a whole, employment of residency graduates, etc.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers. The exam in the specialty includes 3 sections, evaluated on a 100-point assessment scale, where: 20% is the sum of the GPA score for the period of study in internship + GPA for the period of study in the bachelor's degree; 30% - motivational interview; during the interview, members of the selection committee must assess the potential of the applicant for the future, interest in the specialty, motivation, basic knowledge of the profile; 50% - the result of computer testing for the final state attestation of the outgoing year, or testing according to the profile of a group of educational programmes.

### **The second day of the visit is 12/04/2020.**

Meeting with CFO Iskakova S.D. and chief accountant Raisova G.B. made it possible to learn about the reliability of standards 8, 9: financial support of residency programmes, the system of motivation for teachers, mentors and residents, the prospects for the development of residency programmes.

The formation of a university-wide application for the purchase of equipment, educational and methodological literature is carried out on the basis of an analysis of applications for the needs of

departments. The university is carrying out an increase in the informatization and digitalization of key educational processes of the university (up to 70% in 2022), the share of coverage of students and teaching staff, the proportion of coverage of students and teaching staff with access to the Internet (90% in 2022), the acquisition of educational, scientific, medical and simulation equipment, including for higher and vocational technical education (for 65,000, 0 thousand tenge).

A meeting was held with representatives of advisory bodies: scientific secretary A.R. Ryskulova, head of the Educational and Methodological Council A.S. Erbosynova, pro-rector B.S. Turdalieva, head of the clinical activity department D.N. Ligai. showed the reliability of the participation of residents in the work of the Academic Council, the Educational-Methodological, Clinical and Scientific Council.

All regulatory documents on the organization of the educational process, the educational programme in the specialty "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery" discussed at the meeting of the Academic Council, the list of elective disciplines in the specialty was considered at the clinical council, where the representation of employers and residents is provided. Representation of residents on the academic council is not represented.

During a conversation with the head of the Department of Maxillofacial Surgery, Professor Zaytenova G.B. answers were received to the questions of the compliance of the clinical bases with the goals and objectives of the accredited educational programme in the profile of beds, the number of thematic patients, modern equipment and its availability to all students, and the department staff ensure collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, the leadership of the clinical base to achieve the final results of the educational programme specialty 6R113100, 7R021 - "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery". Also received answers to the problems of introducing an educational programme through research (Academic mobility of residents, teachers, the introduction of the Visiting Professor programme).

The experts examined the documentation Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, which confirmed compliance with accreditation standards.

Then a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC started to design the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of EEC members was held. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. Experts have individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the NCN for Compliance with the Accreditation Standards of the Residency Programme by specialties 6R113100, 7R021 - "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery" medical educational institutions of ECAQA. No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector in general and the department implementing the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

Chairman of the EEC Zhanalina B.S. a final open vote on recommendations for KazMUNO and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council were held. Then the chairman of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment in the framework of accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

### **Results of the survey.**

An observer from ECAQA in December 3 to 4, 2020 conducted an online survey of residents and teachers of the accredited educational programme of KazMUNO on the resource <https://webanketa.com/...>

#### **Residents survey results:**

The total number of residents who responded is 84.

Will recommend this university as an educational organization - 85% fully agree, partially - 12%. 74% of the respondents fully agree and 21% partially with the fact that programme managers

and teaching staff are aware of their learning problems. Fully (61%) and partially (10%) are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms and classrooms of the university. According to 72% (in full) and 12% (in part) office equipment is available to residents at practice bases. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - 60% fully agree, partially - 27%. Fully (70%) and partially (26%) are satisfied with the library fund and resources. 75% have access to electronic educational resources in full and 17% believe that in part.

The organization of clinical training for residents, according to 67%, fully satisfies them, and 27% partially. Fully (86%) and partially (8%) are satisfied with the teaching methods. There is enough time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.) - 60% fully agree, partly 25%. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills - 95% fully agree, partially 2%. According to 89% of teachers in the classroom, they use active and interactive teaching methods on a regular basis, and according to 2% - rarely.

According to 69% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after the end of classes, but according to 1% - sometimes and 17% - rarely. 81% are fully satisfied that they are studying at the university, 8% are partially, 5% of the respondents are disappointed. The university allows you to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty of residency; 71% are confident, 19% are not sure, 10% cannot give an answer, 1% would like to believe it, 0% began to doubt it. Fully (83%) and partially (14%) are satisfied with the organization of teaching at KazMUNO.

According to 83% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism to improve educational programmes, but 12% believe that it is not necessary to carry it out and 4% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive - 73%, satisfactory - 21%, i.e., most.

### **Results of the survey of teachers of residency programmes:**

The total number of teachers on the list is 76. The total number of respondents is 76, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 30.26%, up to 10 years - 17.11%, over 10 years - 52.63%. 84.21% are fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process, 14.47% are partially satisfied. At the university, ethics is observed and subordination is fully agreed by 90.79%, partially - 9.21%. 78.95% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, partially 17.11%. The organization has an opportunity for career growth and development of competence for teachers - 80.26% fully agree, partially - 17.11%.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 80.26% fully agree, 17.11% partially. 77.63% of respondents were fully satisfied with the work of the personnel department, 15.79% were partially satisfied. The majority of those surveyed have undergone advanced training for the last 5 years. Only 51.32% fully agree that they can realize themselves as professionals, and 26.32% - partially. Unfortunately, 28.95% did not answer the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and national events, and 34.21% did not apply to the management or the relevant administrative staff of the university. The majority of respondents (85.54%) fully agree, and 5.26% partially agree that residents have free access to patients and clinic resources. In a practical lesson, teachers provide residents primarily with syllabuses (88.16%), control and measuring instruments (76.32%), case studies (61.84%). The level of previous training of residents upon admission to training programmes is fully satisfied by 40.79% of respondents, partially - 47.37%. 26.32% of respondents do not know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers and 10.53% of respondents doubt about their existence. Management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers - 72.37%, sometimes - 17.11% of respondents. When teaching residents, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often work in small groups (63.16%), analysis of situational tasks (77.63%), oral questioning and analysis of a topic (61.84% and 67.11%, respectively), also problem-oriented learning (60.53%), test solving (65.79%), less often cases are compiled and solved

(52.63%). 67.11% completely agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and residency educational programmes, 21.05% partially agree with this.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the appendix and, in general, demonstrate the effective management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of training on residency programmes, at the same time, identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, the availability of leadership and administration for teachers and residents, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers).

### **Conclusion from the external evaluation:**

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and assessed the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the KazMUNO visit programme was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to ensure the reliability of the information provided by KazMUNO and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

When conducting an external examination, the Rules for Training Medical Personnel in the residency were taken into account (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. ҚР ДСМ-16 of September 18, 2018), paragraph 13. It is established that the clinical bases of all residency programmes are 106, which provide training at all levels of medical care (from PHC to a highly specialized), accredited educational programme, there are 30 clinical sites that were not visited by experts due to quarantine measures for CVI. The clinics where the residents' practice is certified by ISO (International Organization for Standardization) and JCI (Joint Commission International) and form a patient-centred work style aimed at ensuring the safety of patients, their correct identification, effective communication, increasing the safety of examination and treatment, and reducing trauma, adherence to successive treatment. The volume of the study load and treatment and prophylactic work by sections of specialties is determined by the individual work plan of the student of the residency (clause 14) for one year and is monitored by the monthly reports of the resident in any form. Accounting for completed tasks is drawn up in the form of a portfolio according to the recommendations of the syllabus.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme for the current state educational standard is being implemented for 4 academic years, therefore, at this time there is one graduate of students, however, the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base has been assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers, students and employers, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development (meetings of departments, CEPs, EMC, Academic Council), the evaluation of educational programmes (CEP), decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical bases, topics of elective disciplines, participation in the appeal commissions for the admission and assessment of residents, the development of the substantive part of the individual plans of residents and the selection of mentors.

At the same time, this substantiated the need for inclusion in post-accreditation monitoring, along with the implementation of the EEC recommendations, an analysis of the implementation of the criteria of Standard 9, an annual report on the contingent of students.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the educational residency programme in the specialty 6R113100, 7R021- "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on 12/04/2020.

The programme of the 2-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been fully completed. On the part of the KazMUNO team, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

#### **4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the residency educational programme in the specialty 6R113100, 7R021 - "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery" and an overview of the strengths for each standard.**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

The staff of the department, implementing the residency programme, as the basis of the mission of the educational programme and goals, accepted the mission of the university and informed the interested parties (teachers, employers, residents) about it in order to clearly understand the tasks and strive to meet the needs of practical healthcare. The structure of the educational programme, where there is a dominance of practical training (75%), the sufficiency of clinical bases and the mentoring system allow strengthening the patient-centred approach in the care and treatment of patients. The university organized training and clinical practice in compliance with safety for all participants in the educational process (safety precautions, use of PPE, pre-training instructions).

Responsible for the residency programme, the Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery with a course in plastic surgery, applies a variety of innovations in the learning process, allowing the development of basic and special competencies of residents, namely, working at the patient's bedside, assisting during surgery, clinical debriefing, solving situational problems, protection of case histories, training in laboratories.

At the same time, the involvement of residents in the scientific work of the department is insufficient, is not of a systemic nature (1.1.7), more is carried out on the initiative of the residents themselves.

The experts received convincing data that the university is autonomous in making decisions in the development of an educational programme in terms of the elective component, the current and final assessment policy, including the choice of assessment methods (testing, oral questioning, clinical examination), selection and admission of residents (specialty exam), personnel policy in relation to teachers for the accredited educational programme, as well as the distribution of resources (classroom fund of clinical bases according to contracts).

The EMCD defines the final learning outcomes in accordance with the qualification requirements for the residency specialty.

The university has developed a Student Ethics Code, with which residents are familiarized and work on the development and improvement of communication skills is carried out systematically and integrated into the work programme.

At the same time, the participation of practical health care in the development of the mission and goals of the educational programme is not sufficiently reflected, expert evaluation is formalized and reviews of practical health care are not collected when forming optional components.

Overall, Standard 1 demonstrates compliance.

##### **Strengths:**

- 1.** Experience in training residents since 2008 and the expansion of training specialties in postgraduate education, provided with the best clinical bases and professional teaching staff.
- 2.** Collaboration with practical healthcare to train residents through a mentoring system.
- 3.** Clear vision and strategic planning in postgraduate clinical education and an appropriate management structure.

4. High motivation, commitment and awareness of residents to fulfil the mission of the educational programme of the specialty “Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery”.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Comply out of 17 standards: fully-10, significantly-7, partially-0, do not comply –0.

**Standard 1:** completed

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

Accredited residency programme in the specialty " Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery " is implemented in accordance with the State Compulsory Standards and Model Professional Curricula for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21. ҚР ДСМ-12/2020 Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of educational programmes of residency with a focus on learning outcomes) for 4 years and during this period, a lot of work has been done to develop teaching materials, organize a place of training for residents, form the composition of departments and identify mentors. A model of the competence of residents has been introduced in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty. The structure, content and duration of the programme are clearly defined. The mechanism for the development and approval of the residency programme is determined and regulated by the CEP.

The staff of the departments has the necessary competencies for training, at the same time, the mentors represented by the staff of the clinical bases, despite the professional level, do not fully possess pedagogical techniques, which limits the implementation of a high-quality transfer of professional knowledge and skills.

In total, according to the accredited educational programme, there are 6 mentors in 3 clinics, which carry out their activities in accordance with the Regulation on mentors. At the clinical base, a mentor is assigned to a resident - a practical health care doctor with the highest qualification category. For example, on the basis of the city hospital No. 5, heads of the admission ward, the department of pediatric and adult maxillofacial surgery. There are no precedents of inequality, lack of ethics or other violations of a gender, cultural or religious nature in the process of external evaluation.

During the examination of the educational programme, it was established that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied, at the same time, residents are not fully involved in the scientific work of the departments, do not have clearly defined research topics, criteria for implementation, including clinical trials.

Thus, the educational residency programme in the specialty " Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery » Demonstrates the integration between education and health care.

### **Strengths:**

- 1) The educational programme in the specialty is developed in accordance with regulatory requirements, a credit-modular system and an integrated training approach are used in the preparation of residents.
- 2) Clinical training of residents is carried out in a multidisciplinary clinical base with ISO (International Organization for Standardization) and JCI (Joint Commission International) certificates.
- 3) Developed mentoring system.
- 4) Experienced teaching staff.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 31 standards correspond: completely - 22, significantly - 9 partially -0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 2:** completed

### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES**

KazMUNO has developed and implemented a policy for assessing residents, which includes the principles and methods of assessment, which are reflected in the Academic policy in the field of higher, postgraduate and additional education of JSC Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education (AII-03-78-2020. Protocol dated 25.06.2020 No. 8). Responsibility for the implementation of the policy for assessing the educational achievements of residents lies with the teaching staff of the departments, heads of departments (modules), the office of the registrar. Information about the point-rating system of assessment is posted on the website [http://www.kazmuno.kz/ru/education/akademicheskaya-politika/...](http://www.kazmuno.kz/ru/education/akademicheskaya-politika/)

The assessment of the educational achievements of residents covers the assessment of key competencies, and the assessment tools themselves are developed by departments / modules - control questions, tasks in test form (MCQ tasks with several options for correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations.

As an additional method for assessing residents, the portfolio is used, which the experts got acquainted with at the departments overseeing the residency programmes. Residents are engaged in research work, which must necessarily end with the publication of a scientific article or a report at scientific and practical conferences. The assessment of scientific work also affects the overall assessment of the discipline.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Standard Curriculum, which is an integral part of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2017, 2020. in the specialties of residency. The forms of conducting are determined by the decision of the EMC. The content of the exams is regulated by the Department of Residency in order to maintain an optimal balance and carry out an integrated assessment of the formation of competencies among residents. The list of compulsory disciplines for the final control during the period of intermediate certification is regulated by the disciplines passed, which are reflected in the working curriculum. The results of educational achievements of students are entered into an electronic educational journal through the AIS system "Platonus", which automatically generates exam sheets.

The procedure and procedure for conducting an appeal is governed by the rules for conducting appeals. Academic policy in the field of higher education PP-03-78-2019 (Protocol No. 5 of 10.07.2019) "Academic policy in the field of residency AP-01-062019" (decision of the Board, Protocol No. 1 dated 06.03.2019).

The development of new control and measuring instruments is carried out by teachers through the study of world experience in assessing knowledge in residency, then it is introduced at the department.

Thus, this standard is generally implemented at the university.

#### **Strengths:**

1) Application of AIS "Platonus", which ensures transparency and speed of recording the results of the residents' assessment.

2) A portfolio of residents has been introduced, which allows assessing the development of additional competencies of a resident.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria* conform from 11 standards: completely - 7, significantly - 4, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

### **Standard 4: TRAINEES**

The university has formed a policy of admission to residency, which is described in detail in the "Rules for admission to residency" for the corresponding academic year, "Academic policy" based on regulatory legal acts. The number of residents is determined based on the capabilities of the university, as well as the needs of practical healthcare. Admission to residency with an indication of the specialty is announced through the media, by placing ads on the university website; the rules of admission and the list of documents can be found on the website: [http- education-admissions](http://education-admissions)

committee-residency. In order to ensure the transparency of the examination procedure, a video recording of the exam is held, observers and members of the commission are present.

The university has a system of academic counseling for residents in departments by curators from the teaching staff and a clinical mentor in a medical organization, which is reflected in the Regulation on mentoring PP-03-41-2019, protocol No. 1 of 03/06/2019. Residents are consulted based on the results of the assessment and questionnaires of residents. During the academic year, it can be presented both in full-time and in remote forms (on-line, in chats, etc.). The university pays attention to the social, financial and personal needs of residents. Social assistance is provided to those in need in accordance with the "Regulations on the system of motivation and remuneration". In order to facilitate the employment of graduates of the University, the Department of Residency annually conducts Personal distribution of graduates with the participation of representatives of health departments, pharmaceutical companies and departments for public health protection of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The university provides support for a resident in the event of a professional crisis, as described in the "Academic Policy of the University". The university has a Resident Council that serves as a public body.

Residency trainees studying on a state educational order are provided with a state scholarship in the prescribed manner.

**Strengths:**

- 1) Availability of Academic residency policy.
- 2) Availability of multidisciplinary clinical sites providing training opportunities with access to various patients.
- 3) The ability to build an individual training programme in the event of special circumstances, including distance learning.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria** conform from 30 standards: fully - 18, significantly -12, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 5: TRAINERS**

The university has developed a "Personnel Management Policy" PUP-01-04-2016 of June 14, 2016, Protocol No. 8; "Instruction on personnel records management" I-03-01-2016 dated January 29, 2016, Protocol No. 16; "Labour regulations" P-03-13-2016, dated January 29, 2016, Protocol No. 16; "Regulations on the organization of the system of remuneration and motivation of employees" PP-03-37-2016 dated June 14, 2016, protocol No. 8, which determine the policy of recruiting and accepting teachers, managers and clinical mentors. The recruitment of teachers for the implementation of the EP is carried out through a competition for filling vacant positions, the procedure for which is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 04.23.2015.

All teachers of the Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery with a course of plastic surgery, participating in the educational process in residency, have an academic degree and a title, the highest qualification category. All teachers of the department passed the Faculty Of Advanced Training And Retraining. in 2018-2019.

The university has developed a programme for the development of teaching staff, mechanisms for advanced training of teaching staff with and without interruption from production. The personnel policy of the university defines the motivation of employees - "Regulations on the organization of the system of remuneration and motivation of employees" dated 06/14/16 and the acts of KazMUNO. The University also maintains and develops a system of non-material remuneration, which includes all forms of recognition of merit and encouragement, there are types of additional payments for teaching staff. The ratio of the number of teachers of the profiling department, who meet the requirements for teaching staff who carry out training in residency, and the number of residents is at least 1: 3.

**Strengths:**

1) High degree of degree of the teaching staff.

2) The presence of a number of regulatory documents aimed at supporting and developing teaching staff, timely professional development, motivation and security.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Correspond to 7 standards: fully -5, significantly -2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 5: completed**

### **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

The University has a sufficient material and technical base for the implementation of the educational programme in the specialty "Oral and maxillofacial surgery, including pediatric surgery", providing residents with appropriate conditions and opportunities for theoretical and practical training, including equipped classrooms, access to the latest professional literature and international sources, adequate information and communication technologies and equipment for teaching practical skills, a safe environment for self-education.

To train residents, the university has signed contracts with 106 clinical bases. Clinical bases of the republican level are 7% (13), regional - 9.2% (17), urban - 38.4% (71), district -10.8% (20), private medical centres / clinics - 30, 3% (56), other departments -4.3% (8) (6.2.1).

Residents in the specialty " Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery ", practical skills were practiced in city polyclinics and hospitals of the city of Almaty in accordance with the syllabus of training in the specialty " Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery ".

The library has official access to the electronic databases THOMSON REUTERS (WEB OF SCIENCE), OXFORD JOURNALS MEDICINE, ELSEVIER, SCOPUS, RSCI, which are used by students and readers of the library. Provided 24-hour access to huge information resources.

When preparing residents in their specialty 6R113100, 7R021- "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery" is actively developing the skill of working in a team.

#### **Strengths:**

1) The University has a developed material and technical base for the implementation of professional training for residents and provides a safe learning environment.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Conforms out of 21 standards: completely -10, significantly -11, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

**Standard 6: completed**

### **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

The university conducts monitoring, evaluation of the EP, with the involvement of stakeholders, structural divisions, the EMC commission for monitoring the educational process, taking into account the expected final learning outcomes, the needs of the healthcare system, the progress of residents, the qualifications of teachers. The process of improving the EP is implemented through the CEP, based on the results of a survey of residents, teaching staff, employers. The decisions of collegial bodies (the Committee of Educational Programmes, the Educational and Methodological Council, the Academic Council) are published on the university website. The results of the discussion of the EP at the EMC, the AC, the meetings of the department are brought to the teaching staff of the University. All stakeholders are involved in the programme evaluation process through representation in the appropriate structures. The results of the assessment are heard at the meetings of the Educational and Methodological Council and the Academic Council. There are some approaches to informing about the results of assessing the clinical practice of residents who are responsible for receiving residents and planning an educational programme. The university involves the main stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation programme of the educational programme. The university studies and analyses the results of feedback on the independent clinical practice of residents. The analysis of the questionnaires is carried out at the level of departments, at the level of the Department of Residency and the Department of Strategic Development and QMS and is discussed at the meetings of the Department of Residency with the teaching staff and structural units, students. KazMUNO has

developed mechanisms for the approval of educational programmes, providing for the evaluation of programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows you to monitor the process of implementation of the EP and ensures the identification and timely solution of emerging problems. According to the order №157 of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the University uses the city's medical and preventive institutions as a clinical base on the basis of contracts. Clinical bases have a certificate of accreditation from the RCHD.

**Strengths:**

- 1) Monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme is constantly carried out, aimed at achieving the mission of the EP.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 15 standards correspond: completely -10, significantly -5, partially -0, do not correspond - 0

**Standard 7: completed**

**Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

EP in specialty 6R113100, 7R021- “Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery” is performed in accordance with the requirements of the regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents (selection criteria and number), the learning process, assessment of knowledge and skills, established learning outcomes, programme management. Students who have successfully passed the state certification are issued a state-recognized document on the conferment of the qualification of a doctor in the specialty "Maxillofacial surgeon".

The university has defined a general strategy, main directions, priorities and objectives of the University's policy in the field of improving the quality of education in accordance with the mission, vision and strategic development plan of the University.

The official website of the university provides information on educational programmes. The website of KazMUNO JSC is available through Facebook, YouTube, Instagram.

The obligations and powers of KazMUNO JSC in relation to the educational programme in the specialties of residency are regulated by the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the internal regulatory documents of the University.

The University has established and operates a quality management system service. Internal assessment of the quality of education is implemented in the processes of self-examination within the framework of internal audit (QMS), self-assessment (accreditation), data collection for ranking the university and programme evaluation. The university follows the recommendations of the national authorized bodies.

**Strengths:**

- 1) Transparency of the management system and decisions made.
- 2) The responsibilities of academic leadership with respect to programme design and management are defined.
- 3) Stable financial condition of the university.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Conforms out of 15 standards: fully -8, significantly - 7, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

**Standard 8: completed**

**Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

The university has initiated procedures to regularly review, update the structure and function of the programme. The renewal process is based on results from prospective studies, analysis of the results, personal experience and a study of the medical postgraduate education literature.

**Strengths:**

- 1) The presence and functioning of the quality management service at the University, the presence of a quality management system.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Conforms out of 4 standards: completely - 1, significantly - 3, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 9: completed**

**6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of residency in the specialty 6R113100, 7R021- " Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, including Pediatric Surgery ":**

1. To improve the quality management system of the university, by defining the main and auxiliary processes of the university, the continuity and interaction of these processes.

2. To revise and finalize the list of competencies of the resident, taking into account the current requirements of society and practical healthcare for maxillofacial surgeons.

3. Develop formal and informal relations with national and international educational and scientific organizations in order to facilitate the exchange of residents and the mutual recognition of learning elements (standard 6.7.4).

4. In the training programme for residents, provide for the issues of medical jurisprudence and forensic medicine, issues of patient safety, responsibility for their own health, knowledge of complementary and alternative medicine through the inclusion of disciplines and an optional component in the topics (2.3.1).

5. Improving learning through research.

6. Apply the rating assessment of teachers and mentors to motivate and develop the professional level and improve the educational process.

7. Improve mechanisms for examining and documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods.

8. Expand and develop methods for assessing clinical skills.

9. Provide informative feedback from employers on the educational programme and use its results to improve the educational programme and the learning process.

10. Expand the representation of residents in the consultative and advisory bodies of the university.

## **7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Board**

The members of the EEC unanimously agreed to recommend that the Accreditation Council accredit the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R113100 "Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, Including Pediatric Surgery " for a period of 5 years.

### **Chairman**

Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekova



### **The foreign expert**

Katropa Liliya Georgieva



### **Academic expert**

Moldava Gulmira Mendiguren



### **Representative of practical health care**

Kalibekova Gulnara Zharkynbekova



### **The representative of the residents**

Gogaladze Consol Latifovich



### **The observer ECAQA**

Umarova Makpal Aldibekova



### List of documents requested by members of the EEC within the framework of accreditation of educational programmes of KazMUNO 3-4.12.

- 2) Portfolio (personal data of the resident)
- 3) REGULATIONS ON THE COMPETITION BEST RESIDENT of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" PP-03-65-2019. Protocol No. 1 dated March 6, 2019
- 4) Report on the questionnaire of residents' satisfaction with the quality of teaching the subject
- 5) Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery. On the topic: Innovative technologies in the complex treatment of trigeminal neuralgia. Executor: Aityn B.Zh. Specialty: Oral and maxillofacial surgery including childhood. Scientific adviser: M.Sc. Inkarbekov Zh.B., Almaty, 2019
- 6) Individual curriculum for residency student Aytyn Bekzhan Zhandosuly.  
Specialty: Maxillofacial surgery, including pediatric surgery. Duration of training in residency: 03.09.2018-31.08.2021. Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery with a course of plastic surgery. Curator: Zaitenova Gulbaran Baygazinovna. Almaty 2018 Document dated 5.09.2018
- 7) Individual curriculum for residency student Muratbek A.Zh.  
Specialty: Maxillofacial surgery, including pediatric surgery. Duration of training in residency: 02.09.2019-31.08.2022. Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery with a course of plastic surgery. Curator: Alimzhanova G.N. Almaty, 2019 Document dated 5.09.2018
- 8) Contract No. 53 / 11-20 on the provision of paid educational services dated February 20, 2020 with Gr. RK Adikhanov Abdibek Abdukarimovich
- 9) Regulations on the organization of the educational process in residency of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" PP-03-46-2019 dated March 06, 2019, Protocol No. 1
- 10) Guidebook for the student of residency of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" SP-03-01-2019 dated March 06, 2019, Protocol No. 1
- 11) Individual curriculum of the residency student Ibrayimov Bolat Timur-Uly.  
Specialty: 7R1109006 "Oral and maxillofacial surgery, including pediatric". Duration of training in residency: 09/01/2020 - 08/31/2023. Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery with a course of plastic surgery. Curator: Zaitenova G.B. Almaty, 2020 Document dated 09/01/2020
- 12) CODE OF HONOR OF THE LISTENER OF RESIDENTURE of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" KЧ-03-01-2017. Protocol No. 22 dated December 23, 2016
- 13) Regulations on the academic mobility of undergraduate students, internships, residents, undergraduates, doctoral students and teaching staff of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" PP-03-25-2019. Document dated March 06, 2019, protocol No. 1
- 14) Individual curriculum for the residency student Asel Kabdenovna Alpysbaeva.  
Specialty: 6R110200 (Family Medicine). Duration of training in residency: 02.09.2019-31.08.2021. Department: Family Medicine. Curator: Alimanova Zhanna Maksutovna. Document dated 09/05/2019
- 15) Regulation on mentoring of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" PP-03-41-2019. Protocol No. 1 dated 06.03.2019
- 16) Report on the questionnaire of employers' satisfaction with the quality of graduate training. Specialty: Family Medicine. Course: 1. Total respondents: 7. City polyclinics: №2, 10, 25, 26
- 17) Analysis of the results of a survey of students of residency about the satisfaction of training for 2019. Almaty 2019
- 18) Regulations on the Council of Residents of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" PP-03-50-2019. Protocol No. 1 dated 06.03.2019
- 19) Regulation on the Department of Residency PP-03-54-2019 dated January 21, 2019 No. 20-OD
- 20) ETHICAL CODE OF STUDENTS AND EMPLOYEES of Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" EK-03-02-2020. Protocol No. 1 dated January 28, 2020
- 21) Protocol of the meeting of the Educational and Methodological Council No. 6 dated June 25, 2020 Chairman of the EMC: Doskozhaeva S. T. Secretary of the UMC: G.K. Kulamanova Attended: 55 people
- 22) RULES FOR ADMISSION to JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" for 2020 from 01.06.2020
- 23) Order on approval of the Clinical Council 23.11.2020 No. 188-OD

- 24) REGULATION ON ACADEMIC HONESTY OF STUDENTS, TEACHERS AND EMPLOYEES OF THE JOINT STOCK COMPANY "KAZAKH MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF LIFELONG EDUCATION" PP-03-72-2019. Protocol No. 6 dated August 28, 2018
- 25) Analysis of the results of the questionnaire survey of residents for January-February 2020 of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education"
- 26) CASE No. 475. Aytyn Bekzhan. Maxillofacial Surgery.
- 27) The programme of the republican conference of dentists with international participation "Actual problems of dentistry"
- 28) Regulations on the passage of professional practice at the clinical bases of the regions of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" PP-03-64-2019. Protocol No. 1 dated 06.03.2019
- 29) Rules for admission to JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" for 2020. Document dated 01.06.2020
- 30) Report on the questionnaire of employers' satisfaction with the quality of graduate training. Specialty: Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery. Course: 1.2. Total respondents: 7. City Clinical Hospital No. 5, Children's Emergency Centre, Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital
- 31) Report on the questionnaire of residents' satisfaction with the quality of teaching the subject. Specialty: Family Medicine. Course: 1. Name of discipline (module): Family medicine. Total respondents: 2.
- 32) ACADEMIC POLICY IN THE FIELD OF HIGHER, POSTGRADUATE AND ADDITIONAL EDUCATION JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" AP-03-78-2020. Protocol dated June 25, 2020 No. 8
- 33) REGULATIONS ON THE BOARD OF RESIDENTS of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" PP-03-50-2019. Protocol No. 1 dated March 6, 2019
- 34) POLICY OF PERSONNEL MANAGEMENT Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" PUP-01-04-2016. Protocol No. 8 dated June 14, 2016
- 35) Key performance indicators and results of the implementation of the strategic plan of KazMUNO JSC for 2017-2021 Protocol No. 10 dated November 20, 2017
- 36) STRATEGIC DEVELOPMENT PLAN of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" for 2017 - 2021. Protocol No. 1 dated February 01, 2017
- 37) TARGET INDICATORS OF THE STRATEGIC DEVELOPMENT PLAN OF THE UNIVERSITY Operational plan of KazMUNO JSC for 2018-2022. Protocol No. 1-1 dated February 13, 2019
- 38) TARGET INDICATORS OF THE STRATEGIC DEVELOPMENT PLAN OF THE UNIVERSITY Operational plan of KazMUNO JSC for 2018-2022. Protocol No. 3 dated February 6, 2020
- 39) TARGET INDICATORS OF THE STRATEGIC DEVELOPMENT PLAN OF THE UNIVERSITY Operational plan of KazMUNO JSC for 2018-2022. Protocol No. 4/1 dated May 25, 2018
- 40) Report of work of KazMUNO JSC for 2018 (annual) dated December 29, 2018
- 41) STRATEGIC DEVELOPMENT PLAN of the Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" for 2018 - 2022. Protocol No. 4/1 dated May 25, 2018
- 42) Report on the implementation of target indicators of the strategic development plan of KazMUNO JSC for 2019. Protocol No. 3 dated February 6, 2020
- 43) REGULATIONS ON THE BOARD of Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" PP-03-02-2016. Protocol No. 4 dated April 04, 2016
- 44) Report on the work of KazMUNO JSC for 2019 dated January 31, 2020